

DICKINSON COLLEGE WRITING AND INFORMATION LITERACY RUBRIC FOR FIRST-YEAR SEMINAR

(ADAPTED BY JOHN MACCORMICK, 2015)

Group I: Structure (30 points)

1. The author identifies a question/problem/issue and proposes a solution/position/approach.

A	B/C	D/F
<p><input type="checkbox"/> The author identifies a compelling question that is sophisticated.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The author presents a thoughtful and compelling thesis while addressing the “so what?” question.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The author identifies a question that may be unfocused or simplistic.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The author presents a sufficient thesis, but may rely on a commonplace approach or explanation. The significance or “so what?” is unclear.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The author does not identify a question, or does not provide a thesis.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The author does not go beyond the most obvious approach and does not address the significance or “so what?”</p>

2. The author organizes the writing logically.

A	B/C	D/F
<p><input type="checkbox"/> The paragraphs are focused and unified.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The essay has an overall clear, logical organization.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Smooth transitions move paragraphs toward a logical conclusion.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> Some paragraphs are focused and unified.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The essay has a clear organization that may not always be logical; the essay may be overly formulaic.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Rough transitions interrupt the flow or consistency of the writing.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> Few paragraphs are focused and unified.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The train of thought in the essay is difficult to follow.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Few transitions guide the reader.</p>

Group II: Content (40 points)

3. The author contextualizes an issue or question.

A	B/C	D/F
<p><input type="checkbox"/> The author brings sources into conversation with each other.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The author makes meaningful connections between the sources and her own ideas.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The sources represent multiple, relevant perspectives.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The author puts the question in the context of broader scholarship but the sources do not dialogue with each other.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The author makes superficial connections between the sources and his own ideas.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The sources represent a limited and/or singular perspective.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The author may cite some sources, but they are marginal or weakly engaged.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The author makes few connections between the sources and her own ideas.</p>

4. The author uses the appropriate type of research and breadth of material.

A	B/C	D/F
<p><input type="checkbox"/> The author makes appropriate choices in source type (scholarly/non-scholarly, news, web, etc.).</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The author acknowledges when he puts sources with different levels of authority in conversation with each other.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The number and variety of sources is appropriate to the task.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The author makes appropriate choices in source types but may overuse some sources.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The author does not always acknowledge crucial differences among sources.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> There may not be enough sources. Support may be limited to a small range of types of information.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The sources are not adequate in quality, variety, and/or number.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The author affords all sources equal authority.</p>

5. The author supports the purpose of the writing through analysis of evidence.

A	B/C	D/F
<p><input type="checkbox"/> The author chooses evidence strategically, not ignoring relevant evidence.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The author consistently supports claims with evidence.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The author examines assumptions and considers implications in establishing and exploring his/her own argument.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The author considers other perspectives when shaping an argument.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The author includes some relevant evidence but may also include irrelevant evidence or ignore some relevant evidence.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The author may include some unsupported claims.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The author occasionally examines assumptions or considers implications of sources.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The author acknowledges other perspectives but does not explore or challenge them.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The author fails to include sufficient or adequate evidence.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The author frequently makes claims that are unsupported by evidence.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The author does not examine assumptions or implications of sources. The topic is summarized or described rather than analyzed.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The author makes an argument despite evidence to the contrary.</p>

Group III: Style (30 points)

6. The author engages the intended audience with a consistent, distinctive voice appropriate to the task.

A	B/C	D/F
<p><input type="checkbox"/> The author shows a nuanced understanding of audience.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Voice is appropriate to the task and enhances the work.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The author shows some awareness of audience.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Voice is appropriate to the task.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The author does not demonstrate an awareness of audience.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Voice is absent or inconsistent.</p>

7. The author adheres to appropriate standards for language usage.

A	B/C	D/F
<p><input type="checkbox"/> Grammar and mechanics are uniformly correct and effective.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Clear and concise sentences convey nuance and complexity.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Word choice is sophisticated.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> Overall, grammar and mechanics are correct and effective, though there may be occasional lapses that do not interfere with a reader's understanding of the text.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Sentences are mostly clear and concise but may not have nuance and complexity.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Word choice is mainly effective but in places it falters.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> Frequent problems with grammar and mechanics detract from meaning.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Sentences are not clear or are overly simplistic.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Word choice is ambiguous and interferes with meaning.</p>

8. The author conforms to appropriate formats for citation of source material, acknowledges borrowed material, and uses sources ethically.

A	B/C	D/F
<p><input type="checkbox"/> The author uses the appropriate citation style, and the citation style is thorough and correct, both within the text and in the citation list or bibliography.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Source material is integrated into the author's sentences.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The author(s) of the integrated source material are cited; exact words are quoted.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The author uses the appropriate citation style, and most citations are correct. Incorrect citations are complete enough to locate the source.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Source material may be integrated awkwardly into the grammar of the author's sentence.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Source material is sparsely or broadly cited, making the boundaries of the citation unclear.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> Citations may be incomplete or inaccurate.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Source material is rarely integrated into the author's sentences.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Sources are not cited; exact wording is not quoted. <i>***If you fail to cite and quote properly, your professor is required to submit an allegation of academic misconduct the Dean of Students office for adjudication.</i></p>