

A proof of Example 4.6 (p114) that more closely resembles the pumping lemma

Claim  $L = \{a^k b^k : k \geq 0\}$  is not regular.

Proof: Assume  $L$  is regular and argue for a contradiction.

As  $L$  is regular, there is a dfa  $M = \{Q, \{a, b\}, S, q_0, F\}$  accepting  $L$ . Set  $m = |Q| + 1$ , so  $m$  is one more than the number of states in  $M$ . Consider the sequence of  $m$  states defined by  $\delta^*(q_0, a^i)$ ,  $i = 1, 2, \dots, m$ .

There are more elements in this sequence than states in the dfa, so at least one state must be repeated.

[This is called the pigeonhole principle].

Pick one of the repeated states and call it  $q$ .

Thus, for two distinct values  $r$  and  $s$  in  $\{1, 2, \dots, m\}$

we have  $\delta^*(q_0, a^r) = \delta^*(q_0, a^s) = q$ .

We may assume  $r < s$  (otherwise swap them).

So let  $l = s-r$ .  $l$  is the length of a cycle of 'a' links starting and ending at  $q$ . Formally,

$$\delta^*(q, a^{nl}) = q \text{ for any } n=0,1,2,\dots$$

We already know that  $M$  accepts  $a^m b^m$ , so

$$\delta^*(q_0, a^m b^m) = \hat{q} \text{ for some } \hat{q} \text{ in } F.$$

But we can insert a cycle of  $l$  'a's after the first  $r$  'a's without affecting the result!

Thus

$$\delta^*(q_0, a^{m+nl} b^m) = \hat{q} \text{ for } n=0,1,2,\dots$$

But  $\hat{q} \in F$ . So in other words,  $M$  accepts  $a^{m+nl} b^m$

for  $n=0,1,2,\dots$ , contradicting the fact that  $M$  accepts only elements of  $L$ . □

Briefer version you can use in UT Quiz

Assume  $L$  is regular, and a dfa  $M = \{Q, \Sigma, \delta, q_0, F\}$  accepts it. Let  $m = |Q| + 1$  and consider  $\delta^*(q_0, a^i)$ ,  $i=1, \dots, m$ .

By the pigeonhole principle, there exists a repeated state  $q$  in this sequence; i.e. we have  $r, s$  with  $1 \leq r < s \leq m$  such that  $\delta^*(q_0, a^r) = \delta^*(q_0, a^s) = q$ .

Thus, a cycle of  $a$ -links of length  $s-r$  starts at  $q$ ,

$$\text{so } \delta^*(q_0, a^m b^m) = \delta^*(q_0, a^{m+n(s-r)} b^m)$$

for  $n = 0, 1, 2, \dots$

This contradicts the fact that  $M$  accepts only strings of the form  $a^k b^k$ .

□